

# Modeling and real-time simulation architectures for virtual prototyping of off-road vehicles

Virtual Reality

March 2011, Volume 15, Issue 1, pp 83–96 | Cite as

- Manoj Karkee (1)
- Brian L. Steward (1) Email author ([bsteward@iastate.edu](mailto:bsteward@iastate.edu))
- Atul G. Kelkar (2)
- Zachary T. KempII (2)

1. Agricultural and Biosystems Engineering Department, Iowa State University, Ames, USA

2. Mechanical Engineering Department, Iowa State University, Ames, USA

SI: Manufacturing and Construction

First Online: [03 January 2010](#)

Received: 24 June 2009

Accepted: 17 December 2009

- [1 Shares](#)
- 748 Downloads
- [13 Citations](#)

## Abstract

Virtual Reality-based simulation technology has evolved as a useful design and analysis tool at an early stage in the design for evaluating performance of human-operated agricultural and construction machinery. Detecting anomalies in the design prior to building physical prototypes and expensive testing leads to significant cost savings. The efficacy of such simulation technology depends on how realistically the simulation mimics the real-life operation of the machinery. It is therefore necessary to achieve ‘real-time’ dynamic simulation of such machines with operator-in-the-loop functionality. Such simulation often leads to intensive computational burdens. A distributed architecture was developed for off-road vehicle dynamic models and 3D graphics visualization to distribute the overall computational load of the system across multiple computational platforms. Multi-rate model simulation was also used to simulate various system dynamics with different integration time steps, so that the computational power can be distributed more intelligently. This architecture consisted of three major components: a dynamic model simulator, a virtual reality simulator for 3D graphics, and an interface to the controller and input hardware devices. Several off-road vehicle dynamics models were developed with varying degrees of fidelity, as well as automatic guidance controller models and a controller area network interface to embedded controllers and user input devices. The simulation architecture reduced the computational load to an individual machine and increased the real-time simulation capability with complex off-road vehicle system models and controllers. This architecture provides an environment to test virtual prototypes of the vehicle systems in real-time and the opportunity to test the functionality of newly developed controller software and hardware.

## Keywords

Real-time simulation Distributed architecture Virtual reality Vehicle dynamics models

Multi-rate simulation

This is a preview of subscription content, [log in](#) to check access

## Notes

## Acknowledgments

This research of the Iowa Agriculture and Home Economics Experiment Station, Ames, Iowa, Project No. 3612, was supported by Hatch Act and State of Iowa funds. The authors would like to thank Deere & Co. for their technical and financial support.

## References

- Antonya C, Talaba D (2007) Design evaluation and modification of mechanical systems in virtual environments. *Virtual Real* 11:275–285  
[CrossRef](https://doi.org/10.1007/s10055-007-0074-6) (<https://doi.org/10.1007/s10055-007-0074-6>)  
[Google Scholar](http://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=Design%20evaluation%20and%20modification%20of%20mechanical%20systems%20in%20virtual%20environments&author=C.%20Antonya&author=D.%20Talaba&journal=Virtual%20Real&volume=11&pages=275-285&publication_year=2007) ([http://scholar.google.com/scholar\\_lookup?title=Design%20evaluation%20and%20modification%20of%20mechanical%20systems%20in%20virtual%20environments&author=C.%20Antonya&author=D.%20Talaba&journal=Virtual%20Real&volume=11&pages=275-285&publication\\_year=2007](http://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=Design%20evaluation%20and%20modification%20of%20mechanical%20systems%20in%20virtual%20environments&author=C.%20Antonya&author=D.%20Talaba&journal=Virtual%20Real&volume=11&pages=275-285&publication_year=2007))
- Bosch R (1991) CAN specification version 2.0. Röber Bousch GmbH, Postfach 300240, D-7000 Stuttgart 30  
[Google Scholar](https://scholar.google.com/scholar?q=Bosch%20R%20%281991%29%20CAN%20specification%20version%202.0.%20Röber%20Bousch%20GmbH%20Postfach%20300240%2C%20D-7000%20Stuttgart%2030) (<https://scholar.google.com/scholar?q=Bosch%20R%20%281991%29%20CAN%20specification%20version%202.0.%20Röber%20Bousch%20GmbH%20Postfach%20300240%2C%20D-7000%20Stuttgart%2030>)
- Castillo-Effen MW, Castillo C, Moreno WA, Valavanis KP (2005) Modeling and visualization of multiple autonomous heterogeneous vehicles. In: Proceedings of the IEEE international conference on systems, man and cybernetics. The Hague, the Netherlands, 10–12 Oct 2005  
[Google Scholar](https://scholar.google.com/scholar?q=Castillo-Effen%20MW%20C%20Castillo%20C%20Moreno%20WA%20C%20Valavanis%20KP%20%282005%29%20Modeling%20and%20visualization%20of%20multiple%20autonomous%20heterogeneous%20vehicles.%20In%3A%20Proceedings%20of%20the%20IEEE%20international%20conference%20on%20systems%2C%20man%20and%20cybernetics.%20The%20Hague%2C%20the%20Netherlands%2C%202010%E2%80%9312%20Oct%202005) (<https://scholar.google.com/scholar?q=Castillo-Effen%20MW%20C%20Castillo%20C%20Moreno%20WA%20C%20Valavanis%20KP%20%282005%29%20Modeling%20and%20visualization%20of%20multiple%20autonomous%20heterogeneous%20vehicles.%20In%3A%20Proceedings%20of%20the%20IEEE%20international%20conference%20on%20systems%2C%20man%20and%20cybernetics.%20The%20Hague%2C%20the%20Netherlands%2C%202010%E2%80%9312%20Oct%202005>)
- Coutee AS, Bras B (2002) Collision detection for virtual objects in a haptic assembly and disassembly simulation environment. In: Proceedings of ASME design engineering technical conferences and computer and information in engineering conference, Montreal, QC, Canada  
[Google Scholar](https://scholar.google.com/scholar?q=Coutee%20AS%20Bras%20B%20%282002%29%20Collision%20detection%20for%20virtual%20object%20in%20a%20haptic%20assembly%20and%20disassembly%20simulation%20environment.%20In%3A%20Proceedings%20of%20ASME%20design%20engineering%20technical%20conferences%20and%20computer%20and%20information%20in%20engineering%20conference%2C%20Montreal%2C%20QC%20Canada) (<https://scholar.google.com/scholar?q=Coutee%20AS%20Bras%20B%20%282002%29%20Collision%20detection%20for%20virtual%20object%20in%20a%20haptic%20assembly%20and%20disassembly%20simulation%20environment.%20In%3A%20Proceedings%20of%20ASME%20design%20engineering%20technical%20conferences%20and%20computer%20and%20information%20in%20engineering%20conference%2C%20Montreal%2C%20QC%20Canada>)
- Cremer J, Kearney J, Papelis Y (1996) Driving simulation: challenges for VR technology. *IEEE Comput Graph Appl* 16(5):16–20  
[CrossRef](https://doi.org/10.1109/38.536270) (<https://doi.org/10.1109/38.536270>)  
[Google Scholar](http://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=Driving%20simulation%3A%20challenges%20for%20VR%20technology&author=J.%20Cremer&author=J.%20Kearney&author=Y.%20Papelis&journal=IEEE%20Comput%20Graph%20Appl&volume=16&issue=5&pages=16-20&publication_year=1996) ([http://scholar.google.com/scholar\\_lookup?title=Driving%20simulation%3A%20challenges%20for%20VR%20technology&author=J.%20Cremer&author=J.%20Kearney&author=Y.%20Papelis&journal=IEEE%20Comput%20Graph%20Appl&volume=16&issue=5&pages=16-20&publication\\_year=1996](http://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=Driving%20simulation%3A%20challenges%20for%20VR%20technology&author=J.%20Cremer&author=J.%20Kearney&author=Y.%20Papelis&journal=IEEE%20Comput%20Graph%20Appl&volume=16&issue=5&pages=16-20&publication_year=1996))
- Cuadrado J, Gonzalez M, Gutierrez R, Naya MA (2004) Real time MBS formulations: towards virtual engineering. In: Product engineering, eco-design technologies and green energies. Springer, Heidelberg, pp 253–272  
[Google Scholar](https://scholar.google.com/scholar?q=Cuadrado%20J%20C%20Gonzalez%20M%20C%20Gutierrez%20R%20C%20Naya%20MA%20%282004%29%20Real%20time%20MBS%20formulations%3A%20towards%20virtual%20engineering.%20In%3A%20Product%20engineering%2C%20eco-design%20technologies%20and%20green%20energies.%20Springer%2C%20Heidelberg%2C%20pp%20253-%E2%80%93272) (<https://scholar.google.com/scholar?q=Cuadrado%20J%20C%20Gonzalez%20M%20C%20Gutierrez%20R%20C%20Naya%20MA%20%282004%29%20Real%20time%20MBS%20formulations%3A%20towards%20virtual%20engineering.%20In%3A%20Product%20engineering%2C%20eco-design%20technologies%20and%20green%20energies.%20Springer%2C%20Heidelberg%2C%20pp%20253-%E2%80%93272>)
- de Sa AG, Zachmann G (1999) Virtual reality as a tool for verification of assembly and maintenance processes. *Comput Graph (Pergamon)* 23:389–403  
[CrossRef](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0097-8493(99)00047-3) ([https://doi.org/10.1016/S0097-8493\(99\)00047-3](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0097-8493(99)00047-3))  
[Google Scholar](http://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=Virtual%20reality%20as%20a%20tool%20for%20verification%20of%20assembly%20and%20maintenance) ([http://scholar.google.com/scholar\\_lookup?title=Virtual%20reality%20as%20a%20tool%20for%20verification%20of%20assembly%20and%20maintenance](http://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=Virtual%20reality%20as%20a%20tool%20for%20verification%20of%20assembly%20and%20maintenance))

ce%20processes&author=AG.%20Sa&author=G.%20Zachmann&journal=Comput%20Graph%20%28Pergamo n%29&volume=23&pages=389-403&publication\_year=1999)

Eberhard P, Li Z (2006) Virtual reality simulation of multibody systems. In: Proceedings of EUROMECH colloquium 476, Ferrol  
[Google Scholar](https://scholar.google.com/scholar?q=Eberhard%20P%20Li%20Z%20%282006%29%20Virtual%20reality%20simulation%20of%20multibod y%20systems.%20In%3A%20Proceedings%20of%20EUROMECH%20colloquium%20476%2C%20Ferrol) ([https://scholar.google.com/scholar?](https://scholar.google.com/scholar?q=Eberhard%20P%20Li%20Z%20%282006%29%20Virtual%20reality%20simulation%20of%20multibod y%20systems.%20In%3A%20Proceedings%20of%20EUROMECH%20colloquium%20476%2C%20Ferrol)  
q=Eberhard%20P%20Li%20Z%20%282006%29%20Virtual%20reality%20simulation%20of%20multibod y%20systems.%20In%3A%20Proceedings%20of%20EUROMECH%20colloquium%20476%2C%20Ferrol)

Fales R, Spencer E, Chipperfield K, Wagner F, Kelkar A (2005) Modeling and control of a wheel loader with a human-in-the-loop assessment using virtual reality. *J Dyn Syst Meas Control* 127:415–423  
[CrossRef](https://doi.org/10.1115/1.1985437) (<https://doi.org/10.1115/1.1985437>)

[Google Scholar](http://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=Modeling%20and%20control%20of%20a%20wheel%20loader%20with%20a%20human-in-the- loop%20assessment%20using%20virtual%20reality&author=R.%20Fales&author=E.%20Spencer&author=K.%20Chipperfield&author=F.%20Wagner&author=A.%20Kelkar&journal=J%20Dyn%20Syst%20Meas%20Con trol&volume=127&pages=415-423&publication_year=2005) ([http://scholar.google.com/scholar\\_lookup?](http://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=Modeling%20and%20control%20of%20a%20wheel%20loader%20with%20a%20human-in-the- loop%20assessment%20using%20virtual%20reality&author=R.%20Fales&author=E.%20Spencer&author=K.%20Chipperfield&author=F.%20Wagner&author=A.%20Kelkar&journal=J%20Dyn%20Syst%20Meas%20Con trol&volume=127&pages=415-423&publication_year=2005)  
title=Modeling%20and%20control%20of%20a%20wheel%20loader%20with%20a%20human-in-the- loop%20assessment%20using%20virtual%20reality&author=R.%20Fales&author=E.%20Spencer&author=K.%20Chipperfield&author=F.%20Wagner&author=A.%20Kelkar&journal=J%20Dyn%20Syst%20Meas%20Con trol&volume=127&pages=415-423&publication\_year=2005)

Fritzson P, Bunus P (2002) Modelica, a general object-oriented language for continuous and discrete-event system modeling and simulation. In: Proceedings of the 35th annual simulation symposium, San Diego, CA, April 2002

[Google Scholar](https://scholar.google.com/scholar?q=Fritzson%20P%2C%20Bunus%20P%20%282002%29%20Modelica%2C%20a%20general%20object- oriented%20language%20for%20continuous%20and%20discrete- event%20system%20modeling%20and%20simulation.%20In%3A%20Proceedings%20of%20the%2035th%20 annual%20simulation%20symposium%2C%20San%20Diego%2C%20CA%2C%20April%202002) ([https://scholar.google.com/scholar?](https://scholar.google.com/scholar?q=Fritzson%20P%2C%20Bunus%20P%20%282002%29%20Modelica%2C%20a%20general%20object- oriented%20language%20for%20continuous%20and%20discrete- event%20system%20modeling%20and%20simulation.%20In%3A%20Proceedings%20of%20the%2035th%20 annual%20simulation%20symposium%2C%20San%20Diego%2C%20CA%2C%20April%202002)  
q=Fritzson%20P%2C%20Bunus%20P%20%282002%29%20Modelica%2C%20a%20general%20object- oriented%20language%20for%20continuous%20and%20discrete- event%20system%20modeling%20and%20simulation.%20In%3A%20Proceedings%20of%20the%2035th%20 annual%20simulation%20symposium%2C%20San%20Diego%2C%20CA%2C%20April%202002)

Glinsky E, Wainer G (2002) Definition of real-time simulation in the CD++ toolkit. In: Proceedings of the summer computer simulation conference, 14–18 July, San Diego, CA

[Google Scholar](https://scholar.google.com/scholar?q=Glinsky%20E%20Wainer%20G%20%282002%29%20Definition%20of%20real- time%20simulation%20in%20the%20CD%2B%2B%20toolkit.%20In%3A%20Proceedings%20of%20the%20su mmer%20computer%20simulation%20conference%2C%2014%20July%20%202002) ([https://scholar.google.com/scholar?](https://scholar.google.com/scholar?q=Glinsky%20E%20Wainer%20G%20%282002%29%20Definition%20of%20real- time%20simulation%20in%20the%20CD%2B%2B%20toolkit.%20In%3A%20Proceedings%20of%20the%20su mmer%20computer%20simulation%20conference%2C%2014%20July%20%202002)  
q=Glinsky%20E%20Wainer%20G%20%282002%29%20Definition%20of%20real- time%20simulation%20in%20the%20CD%2B%2B%20toolkit.%20In%3A%20Proceedings%20of%20the%20su mmer%20computer%20simulation%20conference%2C%2014%20July%20%202002)

Gracanin D, Matijasevic M, Tsourveloudis NC, Valavanis KP (1999) Virtual reality testbed for mobile robots. In: Proceedings of the IEEE international symposium on industrial electronics. Bled, Slovenia, 12–16 July 1999

[Google Scholar](https://scholar.google.com/scholar?q=Gracanin%20D%2C%20Matijasevic%20M%2C%20Tsourveloudis%20NC%2C%20Valavanis%20KP%20%28 1999%29%20Virtual%20reality%20testbed%20for%20mobile%20robots.%20In%3A%20Proceedings%20of%20 the%20IEEE%20international%20symposium%20on%20industrial%20electronics.%20Bled%2C%20Sloveni a%2C%202012%20E2%80%9316%20July%201999) ([https://scholar.google.com/scholar?](https://scholar.google.com/scholar?q=Gracanin%20D%2C%20Matijasevic%20M%2C%20Tsourveloudis%20NC%2C%20Valavanis%20KP%20%28 1999%29%20Virtual%20reality%20testbed%20for%20mobile%20robots.%20In%3A%20Proceedings%20of%20 the%20IEEE%20international%20symposium%20on%20industrial%20electronics.%20Bled%2C%20Sloveni a%2C%202012%20E2%80%9316%20July%201999)  
q=Gracanin%20D%2C%20Matijasevic%20M%2C%20Tsourveloudis%20NC%2C%20Valavanis%20KP%20%28 1999%29%20Virtual%20reality%20testbed%20for%20mobile%20robots.%20In%3A%20Proceedings%20of%20 the%20IEEE%20international%20symposium%20on%20industrial%20electronics.%20Bled%2C%20Sloveni a%2C%202012%20E2%80%9316%20July%201999)

Howard BM, Vance M (2007) Desktop haptic virtual assembly using physically based modelling. *Virtual Real* 11:207–215

[CrossRef](https://doi.org/10.1007/s10055-007-0069-3) (<https://doi.org/10.1007/s10055-007-0069-3>)  
[Google Scholar](http://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=Desktop%20haptic%20virtual%20assembly%20using%20physically%20based%20modelling&author=B.M.%20Howard&author=M.%20Vance&journal=Virtual%20Real&volume=11&pages=207-215&publication_year=2007) ([http://scholar.google.com/scholar\\_lookup?](http://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=Desktop%20haptic%20virtual%20assembly%20using%20physically%20based%20modelling&author=B.M.%20Howard&author=M.%20Vance&journal=Virtual%20Real&volume=11&pages=207-215&publication_year=2007)  
title=Desktop%20haptic%20virtual%20assembly%20using%20physically%20based%20modelling&author=B.M.%20Howard&author=M.%20Vance&journal=Virtual%20Real&volume=11&pages=207-215&publication\_year=2007)

Jayaram S, Jayaram U, Wang Y, Tirumali H, Lyons K, Hart P (1999) VADE: a virtual assembly design environment. *IEEE Comput Graph Appl* 19:44–50

[CrossRef](https://doi.org/10.1109/38.799739) (<https://doi.org/10.1109/38.799739>)  
[Google Scholar](http://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=VADE%3A%20a%20virtual%20assembly%20design%20environment&author=S.%20Jayaram&author=U.%20Jayaram&author=Y.%20Wang&author=H.%20Tirumali&author=K.%20Lyons&author=P.%20Hart&journal=IEEE%20Comput%20Graph%20Appl&volume=19&pages=44-50&publication_year=1999) ([http://scholar.google.com/scholar\\_lookup?](http://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=VADE%3A%20a%20virtual%20assembly%20design%20environment&author=S.%20Jayaram&author=U.%20Jayaram&author=Y.%20Wang&author=H.%20Tirumali&author=K.%20Lyons&author=P.%20Hart&journal=IEEE%20Comput%20Graph%20Appl&volume=19&pages=44-50&publication_year=1999)  
title=VADE%3A%20a%20virtual%20assembly%20design%20environment&author=S.%20Jayaram&author=U.%20Jayaram&author=Y.%20Wang&author=H.%20Tirumali&author=K.%20Lyons&author=P.%20Hart&journal=IEEE%20Comput%20Graph%20Appl&volume=19&pages=44-50&publication\_year=1999)

Johnson TC, Vance JM (2001) The use of the voxmap pointshell method of collision detection in virtual assembly methods planning. In: Proceedings of the ASME design engineering technical conference, Pittsburgh, PA

[Google Scholar](https://scholar.google.com/scholar?q=Johnson%20TC%2C%20Vance%20JM%20%282001%29%20The%20use%20of%20the%20voxmap%20poi ntshell%20method%20of%20collision%20detection%20in%20virtual%20assembly%20methods%20planning.% 20In%3A%20Proceedings%20of%20the%20ASME%20design%20engineering%20technical%20conference%2 C%20Pittsburgh%2C%20PA) ([https://scholar.google.com/scholar?](https://scholar.google.com/scholar?q=Johnson%20TC%2C%20Vance%20JM%20%282001%29%20The%20use%20of%20the%20voxmap%20poi ntshell%20method%20of%20collision%20detection%20in%20virtual%20assembly%20methods%20planning.% 20In%3A%20Proceedings%20of%20the%20ASME%20design%20engineering%20technical%20conference%2 C%20Pittsburgh%2C%20PA)  
q=Johnson%20TC%2C%20Vance%20JM%20%282001%29%20The%20use%20of%20the%20voxmap%20poi ntshell%20method%20of%20collision%20detection%20in%20virtual%20assembly%20methods%20planning.% 20In%3A%20Proceedings%20of%20the%20ASME%20design%20engineering%20technical%20conference%2 C%20Pittsburgh%2C%20PA)

Kang HS, Abdul Jalil MK, Mailah M (2004) A PC-based driving simulator using virtual reality technology. In: Proceedings of ACM SIGGRAPH international conference on virtual reality continuum and its applications in industry, Singapore, 16–18 June 2004

[Google Scholar](https://scholar.google.com/scholar?q=Kang%20HS%2C%20Abdul%20Jalil%20MK%2C%20Mailah%20M%20%282004%29%20A%20PC-based%20driving%20simulator%20using%20virtual%20reality%20technology.%20In%3A%20Proceedings%20of%20ACM%20SIGGRAPH%20international%20conference%20on%20virtual%20reality%20continuum%20and%20its%20applications%20in%20industry%2C%20Singapore%2C%202016%20E2%80%9318%20June%202004) (<https://scholar.google.com/scholar?q=Kang%20HS%2C%20Abdul%20Jalil%20MK%2C%20Mailah%20M%20%282004%29%20A%20PC-based%20driving%20simulator%20using%20virtual%20reality%20technology.%20In%3A%20Proceedings%20of%20ACM%20SIGGRAPH%20international%20conference%20on%20virtual%20reality%20continuum%20and%20its%20applications%20in%20industry%2C%20Singapore%2C%202016%20E2%80%9318%20June%202004>)

Karkee M, Steward BL (2008) Open and closed loop system characteristics of a tractor and an implement dynamic model. ASABE Paper No. 084761. St. Joseph, ASABE, MI

[Google Scholar](https://scholar.google.com/scholar?q=Karkee%20M%20%2C%20Steward%20BL%20%282008%29%20Open%20and%20closed%20loop%20system%20characteristics%20of%20a%20tractor%20and%20an%20implement%20dynamic%20model.%20ASABE%20Paper%20No.%20084761.%20St.%20Joseph%2C%20ASABE%2C%20MI) (<https://scholar.google.com/scholar?q=Karkee%20M%20%2C%20Steward%20BL%20%282008%29%20Open%20and%20closed%20loop%20system%20characteristics%20of%20a%20tractor%20and%20an%20implement%20dynamic%20model.%20ASABE%20Paper%20No.%20084761.%20St.%20Joseph%2C%20ASABE%2C%20MI>)

Kim CE, Vance JM (2003) Using VPS (Voxmap PointShell) as the basis for interaction in a virtual assembly environment. In: SME design engineering technical conferences and computers and information in engineering conference, Chicago, IL, United States

[Google Scholar](https://scholar.google.com/scholar?q=Kim%20CE%2C%20Vance%20JM%20%282003%29%20Using%20VPS%20%28Voxmap%20PointShell%29%20as%20the%20basis%20for%20interaction%20in%20a%20virtual%20assembly%20environment.%20In%3A%20SME%20design%20engineering%20technical%20conferences%20and%20computers%20and%20information%20in%20engineering%20conference%20Chicago%2C%20IL%2C%20United%20States) (<https://scholar.google.com/scholar?q=Kim%20CE%2C%20Vance%20JM%20%282003%29%20Using%20VPS%20%28Voxmap%20PointShell%29%20as%20the%20basis%20for%20interaction%20in%20a%20virtual%20assembly%20environment.%20In%3A%20SME%20design%20engineering%20technical%20conferences%20and%20computers%20and%20information%20in%20engineering%20conference%20Chicago%2C%20IL%2C%20United%20States>)

Lin Q, Kuo C (1997) Virtual tele-operation of underwater robots. In: Proceedings of the IEEE international conference on robotics and automation, Albuquerque, New Mexico, 21–27 April 1997

[Google Scholar](https://scholar.google.com/scholar?q=Lin%20Q%2C%20Kuo%20C%20%281997%29%20Virtual%20tele-operation%20of%20underwater%20robots.%20In%3A%20Proceedings%20of%20the%20IEEE%20international%20conference%20on%20robotics%20and%20automation%2C%20Albuquerque%2C%20New%20Mexico%2C%202001%20E2%80%9327%20April%201997) (<https://scholar.google.com/scholar?q=Lin%20Q%2C%20Kuo%20C%20%281997%29%20Virtual%20tele-operation%20of%20underwater%20robots.%20In%3A%20Proceedings%20of%20the%20IEEE%20international%20conference%20on%20robotics%20and%20automation%2C%20Albuquerque%2C%20New%20Mexico%2C%202001%20E2%80%9327%20April%201997>)

Livani MA, Kaiser J, Jia W (1999) Scheduling hard and soft real-time communication in a controller area network. Control Eng Pract 7:1515–1523

[CrossRef](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0967-0661(99)00128-8) ([https://doi.org/10.1016/S0967-0661\(99\)00128-8](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0967-0661(99)00128-8))

[Google Scholar](https://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=Scheduling%20hard%20and%20soft%20real-time%20communication%20in%20a%20controller%20area%20network&author=MA.%20Livani&author=J.%20Kaiser&author=W.%20Jia&journal=Control%20Eng%20Pract&volume=7&pages=1515-1523&publication_year=1999) ([http://scholar.google.com/scholar\\_lookup?title=Scheduling%20hard%20and%20soft%20real-time%20communication%20in%20a%20controller%20area%20network&author=MA.%20Livani&author=J.%20Kaiser&author=W.%20Jia&journal=Control%20Eng%20Pract&volume=7&pages=1515-1523&publication\\_year=1999](https://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=Scheduling%20hard%20and%20soft%20real-time%20communication%20in%20a%20controller%20area%20network&author=MA.%20Livani&author=J.%20Kaiser&author=W.%20Jia&journal=Control%20Eng%20Pract&volume=7&pages=1515-1523&publication_year=1999))

Pazul K (2009) Controller area network (CAN) basics. Microchip technology, Inc. AN713. Available at: <http://www.cl.cam.ac.uk/research/srg/HAN/Lambda/webdocs/an713.pdf> Accessed: 16 June 2009

Sastry L, Boyd DRS (1998) Virtual environments for engineering applications. Virtual Real 3:235–244

[CrossRef](https://doi.org/10.1007/BF01408704) (<https://doi.org/10.1007/BF01408704>)

[Google Scholar](https://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=Virtual%20environments%20for%20engineering%20applications&author=L.%20Sastry&author=DRS.%20Boyd&journal=Virtual%20Real&volume=3&pages=235-244&publication_year=1998) ([http://scholar.google.com/scholar\\_lookup?title=Virtual%20environments%20for%20engineering%20applications&author=L.%20Sastry&author=DRS.%20Boyd&journal=Virtual%20Real&volume=3&pages=235-244&publication\\_year=1998](https://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=Virtual%20environments%20for%20engineering%20applications&author=L.%20Sastry&author=DRS.%20Boyd&journal=Virtual%20Real&volume=3&pages=235-244&publication_year=1998))

Savall J, Borro D, Gil JJ, Matey L (2002) Description of a haptic system for virtual maintainability in aeronautics. In: Proceedings of 2002 IEEE/RSJ international conference on intelligent robots and systems, Lausanne, Switzerland

[Google Scholar](https://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=Description%20of%20a%20haptic%20system%20for%20virtual%20maintainability%20in%20aeronautics.&author=L.%20Savall&author=D.%20Borro&author=JJ.%20Gil&author=L.%20Matey&journal=Proceedings%20of%202002%20IEEE%20RSJ%20international%20conference%20on%20intelligent%20robots%20and%20systems%2C%20Lausanne%2C%20Switzerland) ([https://scholar.google.com/scholar\\_lookup?title=Description%20of%20a%20haptic%20system%20for%20virtual%20maintainability%20in%20aeronautics.&author=L.%20Savall&author=D.%20Borro&author=JJ.%20Gil&author=L.%20Matey&journal=Proceedings%20of%202002%20IEEE%20RSJ%20international%20conference%20on%20intelligent%20robots%20and%20systems%2C%20Lausanne%2C%20Switzerland](https://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=Description%20of%20a%20haptic%20system%20for%20virtual%20maintainability%20in%20aeronautics.&author=L.%20Savall&author=D.%20Borro&author=JJ.%20Gil&author=L.%20Matey&journal=Proceedings%20of%202002%20IEEE%20RSJ%20international%20conference%20on%20intelligent%20robots%20and%20systems%2C%20Lausanne%2C%20Switzerland))

Schulz M, Reudig T, Ertl T (1998) Analyzing engineering simulations in a virtual environment. IEEE Comput Graph Appl 18(6):46–52

[CrossRef](https://doi.org/10.1109/38.734979) (<https://doi.org/10.1109/38.734979>)

[Google Scholar](https://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=Analyzing%20engineering%20simulations%20in%20a%20virtual%20environment&author=M.%20Schulz) ([http://scholar.google.com/scholar\\_lookup?title=Analyzing%20engineering%20simulations%20in%20a%20virtual%20environment&author=M.%20Schulz](https://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=Analyzing%20engineering%20simulations%20in%20a%20virtual%20environment&author=M.%20Schulz))

[z&author=T.%20Reuding&author=T.%20Ertl&journal=IEEE%20Comput%20Graph%20Appl&volume=18&iss ue=6&pages=46-52&publication\\_year=1998](#)

Stankovic J (1988) Misconceptions about real time computing: a serious problem for next generation systems. *IEEE Computer* 21(10):10–19

Google Scholar ([http://scholar.google.com/scholar\\_lookup?title=Misconceptions%20about%20real%20time%20computing%3A%20a%20serious%20problem%20for%20next%20generation%20systems&author=J.%20Stankovic&journal=IEEE%20Computer&volume=21&issue=10&pages=10-19&publication\\_year=1988](http://scholar.google.com/scholar_lookup?title=Misconceptions%20about%20real%20time%20computing%3A%20a%20serious%20problem%20for%20next%20generation%20systems&author=J.%20Stankovic&journal=IEEE%20Computer&volume=21&issue=10&pages=10-19&publication_year=1988))

Wan H, Gao S, Peng Q, Dai G, Zhang F (2004) MIVAS: a multi-modal immersive virtual assembly system. In: Proceedings of the ASME design engineering technical conference, Salt Lake City, UT

Google Scholar (<https://scholar.google.com/scholar?q=Wan%20H%2C%20Gao%20S%2C%20Peng%20Q%2C%20Dai%20G%2C%20Zhang%20F%20%282004%29%20MIVAS%3A%20a%20multi-modal%20immersive%20virtual%20assembly%20system.%20In%3A%20Proceedings%20of%20the%20ASME%20design%20engineering%20technical%20conference%2C%20Salt%20Lake%20City%2C%20UT>)

Zhu Z, Gao S, Wan H, Luo Y, Yang W (2004) Grasp identification and multi-finger haptic feedback for virtual assembly. In: Proceedings of the ASME design engineering technical conference, Salt Lake City, UT

Google Scholar (<https://scholar.google.com/scholar?q=Zhu%20Z%2C%20Gao%20S%2C%20Wan%20H%2C%20Luo%20Y%2C%20Yang%20W%20%282004%29%20Grasp%20identification%20and%20multi-finger%20haptic%20feedback%20for%20virtual%20assembly.%20In%3A%20Proceedings%20of%20the%20ASME%20design%20engineering%20technical%20conference%2C%20Salt%20Lake%20City%2C%20UT>)

## Copyright information

© Springer-Verlag London Limited 2010

## About this article

Cite this article as:

Karkee, M., Steward, B.L., Kelkar, A.G. et al. *Virtual Reality* (2011) 15: 83. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10055-009-0150-1>

- DOI (Digital Object Identifier) <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10055-009-0150-1>
- Publisher Name Springer-Verlag
- Print ISSN 1359-4338
- Online ISSN 1434-9957
- [About this journal](#)
- [Reprints and Permissions](#)

## Personalised recommendations

1. Modeling, Simulation and Development of an Automatic Vacuum Packer for Rice Using Functional Virtual Prototyping  
Yan, T.Y.... Chung, J.H.  
*Journal of Biosystems Engineering* (2004)
2. Design of TMS320C40 signal processors and programmable logic based prototyping environment of real-time machine vision architectures  
Rautiola, Kyösti... Jokitalo, Pekka  
*Microprocessing and Microprogramming* (1993)
3. Knowledge-Based Integration Between Virtual and Physical Prototyping for Identifying Behavioral Constraints of Embedded Real-Time Systems  
Rai, L.... Soon Ju Kang,  
*IEEE Transactions on Systems, Man, and Cybernetics - Part A: Systems and Humans*

Want recommendations via email? [Sign up now](#)

Powered by: Recommended 

**SPRINGER NATURE**

© 2017 Springer International Publishing AG. Part of [Springer Nature](#).

Not logged in Not affiliated 23.233.26.123